## **Critical Synthesis Paper Rubric**

Criteria	Ratings				
Creates an	Mastery	Competence	Needs	Unsatisfactory	
organizing	Skillfully selects	Selects and	Improvement	Does not select	
structure	and summarizes key	summarizes key	Attempts to select	and summarize	
establishes context	ideas to establish	ideas to establish	and summarize key	key ideas to set	
& relevance	context appropriate	context appropriate	ideas to establish	context. Writing	
	to audience by using	to audience by using	context but	is disjointed and	
	tools such as precise	tools such as precise	selections may be	there is little	
	language,	language,	invalid, insufficient,	evidence of	
	descriptive	descriptive	or unclear. Uses an	organization.	
	language, and	language, and	organizational		
	authoritative voice.	authoritative voice.	structure that causes		
	Uses an	Uses an	confusion. Shows		
	organizational	organizational	some elements of		
	structure that	structure that allows	organization.		
	enhances the	for a progression of			
	response. The	ideas to develop.			
	opening, body, and	Includes an opening,			
	closure are well	body, and closure.			
A 1	organized.	<b>G</b> .	NY Y	TT (* C	
Analysis of	Mastery	Competence	Needs	Unsatisfactory	
Relevant	Experience	Experience	Improvement	Experiences do	
Experiences,	descriptions,	descriptions and	Experience	not relate to	
Thoughts, Constructed	reflections, are in-	reflections	descriptions and	competency and reflections do not	
	depth and relate to	adequately relate to	reflections begin to demonstrate relation	demonstrate	
Knowledge	competency while providing clear	competency and		understanding of	
	insight.	provide acceptable insight.	to competency, but little or no insightful	competency.	
	msight.	msight.	commentary.	competency.	
			commentary.		
Synthesis of	Mastery	Competence	Needs	Unsatisfactory	
Theory and	Demonstrates a	Demonstrates a	Improvement	Demonstrates a	
<b>Experience</b>	broad array of	broad array of	Demonstrates a	broad array of	
Experience	experience and	experience and	broad array of	experience but	
	clearly connects it to	clearly connects it to	experience but only	does not connect	
	appropriate	appropriate	connects it to the	it to appropriate	
	theoretical	theoretical	appropriate	theoretical	
	constructs showing	constructs. Some	theoretical	constructs.	
	deep understanding	synthesis across	constructs in a weak	Little to no	
	and thoughtfulness.	multiple program	and superficial	synthesis across	
	Synthesis across	domains. Adequate	manner. Minimal	program domains.	
	all/multiple program	referencing to	synthesis across	Unacceptable	
	domains is clear and	support context in	program domains.	referencing to	
	consistent.	valid manner.	Inadequate	support context.	
	Exceptional		referencing to		
	referencing to		support context in		
	support context in		valid manner.		
	valid manner.				

Criteria	Ratings					
Demonstrates	Mastery	Competence	Needs	Unsatisfactory		
appropriate use of	Demonstrates	Demonstrates	Improvement	Demonstrates		
grammar, APA	consistent control of	control of usage,	Demonstrates some	little control of		
style/UTC	grammar, usage,	grammar,	control of usage,	usage, grammar,		
formatting, and	punctuation,	punctuation,	grammar,	punctuation,		
EndNote	sentence	sentence	punctuation,	sentence		
	construction, and	construction, and	sentence	construction, and		
	spelling. Consistent	spelling. Occasional	construction, and	spelling.		
	APA style/UTC	errors do not	spelling. Errors	Numerous errors		
	formatting and	interfere with	interfere with	interfere with		
	EndNote adherence.	meaning.	meaning. Some	meaning. Little		
		Reasonable	conformity to APA	conformity to		
		conformity to APA	style/UTC	APA style/UTC		
		style/UTC	formatting and	formatting.		
		formatting and	EndNote.	EndNote not		
		EndNote.		applied.		
Overview of	Mastery	Competency	Needs	Unsatisfactory		
Research Agenda	Provides a broad	Provides a broad	Improvement	Provides an		
Research Agenda	overview of a	overview of a	Provides a broad	overview of a		
	research agenda	research agenda	overview of a	research agenda		
	going into	going into	research agenda	going into		
	dissertation/research	dissertation/research	going into	dissertation/		
	project of practice;	project of practice;	dissertation/ research	research project		
	exceeds 500 words;	achieves 500 words	project of practice;	of practice; does		
	exceptional	minimum; adequate	does not achieve the	not achieve the		
	connection to	connection to related	500-word minimum;	500-word		
	related literature	literature	limited connection	minimum; little		
			to related literature	connection to		
				related literature		