

Critical Synthesis Paper Rubric

Criteria	Ratings			
Creates an organizing structure establishes context & relevance	Mastery Skillfully selects and summarizes key ideas to establish context appropriate to audience by using tools such as precise language, descriptive language, and authoritative voice. Uses an organizational structure that enhances the response. The opening, body, and closure are well organized.	Competence Selects and summarizes key ideas to establish context appropriate to audience by using tools such as precise language, descriptive language, and authoritative voice. Uses an organizational structure that allows for a progression of ideas to develop. Includes an opening, body, and closure.	Needs Improvement Attempts to select and summarize key ideas to establish context but selections may be invalid, insufficient, or unclear. Uses an organizational structure that causes confusion. Shows some elements of organization.	Unsatisfactory Does not select and summarize key ideas to set context. Writing is disjointed and there is little evidence of organization.
Analysis of Relevant Experiences, Thoughts, Constructed Knowledge	Mastery Experience descriptions, reflections, are in-depth and relate to competency while providing clear insight.	Competence Experience descriptions and reflections adequately relate to competency and provide acceptable insight.	Needs Improvement Experience descriptions and reflections begin to demonstrate relation to competency, but little or no insightful commentary.	Unsatisfactory Experiences do not relate to competency and reflections do not demonstrate understanding of competency.
Synthesis of Theory and Experience	Mastery Demonstrates a broad array of experience and clearly connects it to appropriate theoretical constructs showing deep understanding and thoughtfulness. Synthesis across all/multiple program domains is clear and consistent. Exceptional referencing to support context in valid manner.	Competence Demonstrates a broad array of experience and clearly connects it to appropriate theoretical constructs. Some synthesis across multiple program domains. Adequate referencing to support context in valid manner.	Needs Improvement Demonstrates a broad array of experience but only connects it to the appropriate theoretical constructs in a weak and superficial manner. Minimal synthesis across program domains. Inadequate referencing to support context in valid manner.	Unsatisfactory Demonstrates a broad array of experience but does not connect it to appropriate theoretical constructs. Little to no synthesis across program domains. Unacceptable referencing to support context.

Criteria	Ratings			
Demonstrates appropriate use of grammar, APA style/UTC formatting, and EndNote	Mastery Demonstrates consistent control of grammar, usage, punctuation, sentence construction, and spelling. Consistent APA style/UTC formatting and EndNote adherence.	Competence Demonstrates control of usage, grammar, punctuation, sentence construction, and spelling. Occasional errors do not interfere with meaning. Reasonable conformity to APA style/UTC formatting and EndNote.	Needs Improvement Demonstrates some control of usage, grammar, punctuation, sentence construction, and spelling. Errors interfere with meaning. Some conformity to APA style/UTC formatting and EndNote.	Unsatisfactory Demonstrates little control of usage, grammar, punctuation, sentence construction, and spelling. Numerous errors interfere with meaning. Little conformity to APA style/UTC formatting. EndNote not applied.
Overview of Research Agenda	Mastery Provides a broad overview of a research agenda going into dissertation/research project of practice; exceeds 500 words; exceptional connection to related literature	Competency Provides a broad overview of a research agenda going into dissertation/research project of practice; achieves 500 words minimum; adequate connection to related literature	Needs Improvement Provides a broad overview of a research agenda going into dissertation/ research project of practice; does not achieve the 500-word minimum; limited connection to related literature	Unsatisfactory Provides an overview of a research agenda going into dissertation/ research project of practice; does not achieve the 500-word minimum; little connection to related literature