Module 1: American Citizenship Past, Present, and Future?

Hunt Davidson
Chattanooga Christian School
Chattanooga, TN

Editor’s note: Most of this module was created over a several year period by Chattanooga Christian School History Department Chair Gary Lindley, working with Hunt Davidson. Portions of this module can be traced back to Covenant College Professor Steve Kaufmann. The editor expanded the original module and added supplemental information and activities.

The module was developed and utilized for a ninth-grade civics and American government class. However, the content of the module is “high expectations,” and the module can be utilized in most high school standard or honors U.S. government or history classes. The module was created for a Christian school, but this version is designed for use in both public and private schools.

Estimated module length: Three hours and fifteen minutes (about one hour each for three classes, about thirty to forty-five minutes for day one’s homework, and about forty-five to sixty minutes for day two’s homework)

Overview

The essential question “What does it mean to be an American citizen?” has been at the heart of our national dialogue since the founding. Indeed, simply investigating our original national motto, *e pluribus unum* (“out of many, one”), reveals that a general conceptualization of what kind of people we were to be was central to understanding the Founders’ conceptions of the Republic and of national identity. What have many Americans believed to be “good citizenship” at various junctures in our history? Have these beliefs changed, and if so, how? What contemporary visions of American citizenship might have the most profound future ramifications and why?

This module is a systematic exploration of the above essential questions that utilizes class discussion and reflection, primary source excerpts, and historical fiction. It only scratches the surface of this important subject.
Objectives

Students will:
Demonstrate an understanding of various definitions of citizenship.

Utilize primary source excerpts from American schoolbooks to understand what children were taught about good citizenship in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries.

Compare and contrast how American schools and our culture define what constitutes a “good citizen” now and what might be expected of good citizens in the future.

Investigate and explore the idea of citizenship through reading Edward Everett Hale’s short story "The Man Without a Country" and utilize the related workshop available on the website What So Proudly We Hail.

Prerequisite knowledge

The model was written to enable students to gain knowledge appropriate for understanding citizenship in general, and American citizenship in particular. The assumption is that students will have had no prior experience with any of the primary sources. However, there is an expectation that students have basic familiarity with the concept of “citizenship” and an elemental understanding of terms such as republic, voting, rights, and duties.

Module introduction: Exploring the Concept of Citizenship (class one)

At the beginning of the first class, have students in one to three sentences define citizenship in their own words. Then, lead a whole-class discussion where students both discuss their respective definitions and think more deeply about the concept of citizenship through addressing the following questions:

Do definitions, qualifications, and expected actions of citizenship and citizen action differ depending on historical era or geographic place? If so, cite examples.

Do you think of yourself as a citizen of your school, community, or city? The U.S.? The world? All of the above? For any category you select, give specific examples of what a good citizen would believe or do.

Which level of citizenship do you consider most important? Why? Defend your answer.

At the conclusion of the introductory discussion, explain that the class will now investigate how many Americans have historically conceptualized citizenship and being a “good” American citizen, how the concept is perceived in the contemporary U.S., and how it might be perceived in the future (estimated time, fifteen minutes).
American Citizenship: Changing Definitions and Expectations?

Begin this discussion by providing students with a conventional definition of national citizenship.

A citizen is a person who possesses all the privileges and responsibilities granted by the law of a nation to residents who have legal status.

Briefly ask students for specific examples of privileges and responsibilities now granted to American citizens, and correct any factually erroneous student answers (estimated time, ten minutes).

Then, ask students to write a one- to two-sentence answer to the following question: Please cite any examples you know of how definitions of who is a U.S. citizen, or privileges granted to groups of Americans, have changed throughout our history?

Have students share their answers and correct any erroneous student answers. The expectation is at least some students will be aware of examples like African-Americans being granted citizenship and women being granted the right to vote (estimated time, fifteen minutes).

As a final activity for class one and a prelude for subsequent work with American primary source excerpts, begin with the following introduction or a similar one:

If our great-great-great grandparents were citizens in eighteenth- or nineteenth-century America, how would they answer this question: What were the values of the young Republic?

If one wants to understand a time period, one good place to start is to look at that time period’s schoolbooks; what were most children of an era commonly reading and learning together? Often what people collectively experience binds them together.

To help frame this idea, consider the following advice long ago from St. Augustine, who articulated one vision that is germane to national citizenship even though he used it in a different context:

Augustine asserted in his work *City of God* that in order to define a people, one should discover the “… loved things held in common. Then, if we wished to discern the character of any given people, we would have to investigate what it loves…. Surely it is a better or worse people as it is united in loving things that are better or worse.”

Then, have students in a “think, pair, share” activity with a partner consider what are the “loved things held in common” today by American citizens? First, students think silently and write down their answers, then compare lists with a partner (estimated time, five minutes).

Facilitate a short whole-class discussion and write the most common items students identified on the board. Note the items in the list so that they can be discussed further in class No. 2 (estimated time, ten to twenty minutes).

End class one with a description of the homework assignment for class No. 2: The first paragraph linking Augustine’s comment about common learning to homework is especially important, but if
possible, arouse student curiosity by using some or all of the short descriptions of the books read by so many American children in earlier times in our nation’s history (estimated time, three to five minutes).

To discover the “loved things held in common” by many citizens of the early Republic, we will look at examples of instruction and values common in the schooling of earlier Americans, from before the United States was even a country to the beginning of World War II. We will work with selections from the three most important schoolbooks for children that were widely used in earlier times; they provided a common learning for many Americans. For homework, you will investigate selections from each of these early schoolbooks. Remember Augustine’s advice—what are the “loved things held in common” by the early American citizens?

Note: The accompanying worksheet and all primary source excerpts that follow are available at this link (https://www.utc.edu/center-reflective-citizenship/pdfs/crchuntm1materials.pdf)

Primary source material descriptions:

*The New England Primer,*


*The New England Primer*, first published in 1687 or 1688 and written by Benjamin Harris, a British journalist who immigrated to Boston, was highly popular through the first few decades of the nineteenth century. It was the most popular schoolbook in the English colonies and the early Republic for over 150 years and served as the foundation of most schooling before the 1790s.

Webster’s Blue-Back Speller, first published in 1783 by prominent New England American educator and statesman Noah Webster, eclipsed The New England Primer as one of the most important schoolbooks in America during the 1800s. Educational historian Lawrence indicated millions of copies were published during much of the nineteenth century, and even Chief Sequoyah, who created the Cherokee alphabet and a written language, used the Speller as a model.

![William McGuffey](https://tinyurl.com/y8855agb)

College President William McGuffey first created textbooks for different grades, known as McGuffey’s Readers, in 1836 in Oxford, Ohio. Between 1836 and 1870, forty-seven million copies of the series were sold, and successive editions of McGuffey’s Readers remained popular for almost half of the twentieth century.

Distribute "The Formation of Citizens" worksheet and the primary source excerpts.
The Formation of Citizens Worksheet

The United States of America was profoundly shaped by the events, ideas, and values of the first fifty years of our existence. The United States today is facing a serious dilemma: For well over 100 years, traditional values have been challenged by new ones. Should we welcome these new values or resist them? The question for us today is whether we the people of the United States will try to retain our original “shape” or whether we will take on a new “shape” according to the changing values of our own day and time. The only way for us to answer this question is to understand what those traditional values were and attempt to value perspectives that challenge older beliefs.

To that end, we are going to explore how education helps reveal and shape our national values. Schooling is the process of shaping the next generation. Both parents and teachers teach skills, but they also teach values. These skills and values, when combined together, form citizens. What follows are three early examples of what most schoolchildren in our young Republic learned (from before the War for Independence until about World War II). Please note both the difficulty level of and the values taught within the readings. What sort of citizens would these texts create?

I. Schoolbook example No. 1: The New England Primer by Benjamin Harris (1673–1716)

This was first published in 1687 or 1688 and was the most popular schoolbook in America for nearly two centuries. It was the foundation of most schooling in our nation up to the 1790s.

Directions: Take the two letters indicated by your first and last name (for example, mine would be "H" and "D"), and by using the appropriate reading selection explain the moral and religious precepts that are taught by the little verse that accompanies each letter. Then answer No. 3 based on the whole alphabet.

1. Letter of your first name: ____
   a. What moral and/or religious precept (a general rule) is being taught?

2. Letter of your last name: ____
   a. What moral and/or religious precept is being taught?
3. Even in the midst of teaching something as rote (mechanical, habitual, routine) as the alphabet, deep values are being taught. Name at least two of those values (must be different than your answers from Nos. 1 or 2).

II. Schoolbook example No. 2: Webster’s Blue-Back Speller by Noah Webster (1758–1843)

This was first published in 1783 and eclipsed The New England Primer as the most important and most used schoolbook for teaching schoolchildren in America during the 1800s.

Directions: Using the appropriate reading selection, answer the following questions:

1. What reading skills are these fifteen short lessons intended to teach students?

2. Name three specific themes you observe upon reading through all fifteen lessons
   a. 
   b. 
   c.
3. Read again and pay especial attention to the last four lessons (XII–XV). Describe the moral lessons that are being inculcated in children through these lessons. Do not just copy the lessons verbatim. Please put your answer in your own words.

4. Remember, almost every child in the United States learned these things. What do you think would happen if every young child in the United States was given a schoolbook with these lessons in it today?

III. Schoolbook example No. 3: McGuffey’s Readers by William McGuffey (1800–1873)

These were first published in 1836 and replaced Webster’s Blue-Back Speller during the second half of the nineteenth century as the primary American schoolbook of choice. It remained highly prominent up through World War II.

Although by 1850, 61 percent of all American children attended common (later called public) schools, few students entered secondary schools. Beginning after the Civil War, elementary schooling became an even more common experience for American children. Attendance past eighth grade was very rare. In 1900, only a little over 6 percent of American students graduated from high school, and even fewer went on to college (Educational Policy Institute, April 2011).

William McGuffey’s Eclectic Readers were the most widely used schoolbook during this time and well into the twentieth century. (“Eclectic” means stories taken from many different sources.) The fact that these books were almost universally studied among American children meant that the stories themselves (and the values therein) were an essential part of the common identity for American citizens.
Directions: For each of the corresponding selections, note the vocabulary and the reading level (hard? easy?) of the story, but in particular note the moral tone or lesson. What values and lessons are being taught by each selection?

1. “The Three Kingdoms” (from the third-grade reader):

2. “Robert Bruce and the Spider” (from the third-grade reader):

3. “Extract from the Sermon on the Mount” (from the fourth-grade reader):
   a. (Note especially the follow-up questions, both those having to do with content and those having to do with language and grammar.)

4. “The Idle School-Boy” (from the fourth-grade reader):
The New England Primer: The Alphabet

A
In Adam’s Fall
We Sinned all.

B
Thy Life to Mend
This Book Attend.

C
The Cat doth play
And after stay.

D
A Dog will bite
A Thief at night.

E
An Eagles flight
Is out of fight.

F
The Idle Fool
Is whipped at School.

G
As runs the Glass
Mans life doth pass

H
My Book and Heart
Shall never part.

J
Job feels the Rod
Yet blesses GOD.

K
Our King the good
No man of blood.

L
The Lion bold
The Lamb doth hold.

M.
The Moon gives light
In time of night.

N
Nightingales sing
In Time of Spring.

O
The Royal Oak
It was the Tree
That saved His Royal Majesty

P
Peter denies
His Lord and cries

Q
Queen Esther comes in Royal State To Save the JEWS from dismal Fate

R
Rachel doth mourn.
For her first born.

S
Samuel anoints
Whom God appoints

T
Time cuts down all
Both great and small.

U
Uriah's beauteous Wife
Made David seek his Life

W
Whales in the Sea
God's Voice obey.

X
Xerxes the great did die,
And so must you & I,

Y
Youth forward slips
Death soonest nips.

Z
Zacheus he
Did climb the Tree
His Lord to see
Table XIII

Lessons of easy words, to teach children to read and to know their duty.

Lesson I.
NO man may put off the land of God
My joy is in His law all the day
O may I not go in the way of sin!
Let me not go in the way of ill men.

II.
A bad man is a foe to the law;
It is his joy to do ill.
All men go out of the way.
Who can say he has no sin?

III.
The way of man is ill.
My son do as you are bid:
But if you are bid, do no ill.
See not my sin, and let me not go to the pit.

IV.
Rest in the Lord, and mind his word.
My son, hold fast the law that is good.
You must not tell a lie, nor do hurt.

V.
Do as well as you can, and do no harm. Mark
the man that doth well, and do so too. Help
such as want help, and be kind.
Let your sins past put you in mind to mend.

VI.
I will not walk with bad men, that I may not be cast off with them. I
will love the law and keep it.
I will walk with the just and do good.

VII.
The life is not long: but the life to come has no end.
We must pray for them that hate us.
We must love them that love not us.
We must do as we like to be done to.

VIII.
A bad life will make a bad end.
He must live well that will die well. He
doeth live ill that doth not mend. In
time to come we must do no ill.
IX.
No man can say that he has done no ill: For all men have gone out of the way. There is none that doth good; no not one. If I have done harm, I must do it no more.

X.
Sin will lead us to pain and woe.
Love that which is good and shun vice.
Hate no man, but love both friends and foes. A bad man can take no rest, day nor night.

XI.
He who came to save us, will wash us from all sin; I will be glad in his name.
A good boy will do all that is just; he will flee from vice; he will do good, and walk in the way of life.
Love not the world, nor the things that are in the world; for they are sin.
I will not fear what flesh can do to me; for my trust is in him who made the world:
He is nigh to them that pray to him, and praise his name.

XII.
Be a good child; mind your book; love your school, and strive to learn.
Tell no tales; call no ill names; you must not lie, nor swear, nor cheat, nor steal.
Play not with bad boys; use no ill words at play; spend your time well; live in peace and shun all strife. This is the way to make good men love you, and save your soul from pain and woe.

XIII.
A good child will not lie, swear, nor steal.
He will be good at home, and ask to read his book; when he gets up he will wash his hands and face clean; he will comb his hair, and make haste to school; he will not play by the way, as bad boys do.

XIV.
When good boys and girls are at school, they will mind their books, and try to learn to spell and read well, and not play in the time of school. When they are at church, they will sit, kneel, or stand still; and when they are at home, will read some good book that God may bless them,

XV.
As for those boys and girls that mind not their books, and love not the church and school, but play with such as tell tales, tell lies, curse, swear and steal, they will come to some bad end, and must be whipt till they mend their ways.
New McGuffey Third Reader: “The Three Kingdoms”

Prussia welcome feared childish
kingdom pathway lady courage
table greatly grant worthy
agreeable

THE THREE KINGDOMS.

King Frederic of Prussia, when traveling through his kingdom, came one day to a pretty village where he was to stay a little while. The people of the village were greatly pleased to have a visit from their king, and had done many things to make his stay pleasant and agreeable.

The school children sang songs of welcome, and threw flowers in his pathway. The king visited the school and was pleased to see how well the children knew their lessons. After a time he turned to the teacher, and said he would like to ask the children a few questions. On a table near by, stood a large dish of oranges.

The king took up one of the oranges, and said, “To what kingdom does this belong, children ?

“To the vegetable kingdom,” answered one of the little girls.

“And to what kingdom does this belong?,” said he, as he took from his pocket a piece of gold money.

“To the mineral kingdom,” she answered.

“And to what kingdom, then, do I belong, my child ?” he asked, thinking, of course, she would answer, “To the animal kingdom.”

The little girl did not know what answer to make. She feared it would not seem just right to say to a king that he belonged to the animal kingdom.

“Well,” said the good king, “can you not answer that question, my little lady ?” The kind words and gentle look of the king gave the little girl courage to speak the thought that was in her mind. She trembled a little as she stood before him, but, looking up into his face, she answered, I think, sir, to the kingdom of Heaven.”

The king placed his hand upon her head. A tear stood in his eye. He was deeply moved by her childish words, and said, “ God grant that I may be found worth of that kingdom!
ROBERT BRUCE AND THE SPIDER.

Nearly six hundred years ago there was a king of Scotland whose name was Robert Bruce. Those were very rude times. The king of England wanted to rule over Scotland, and he led an army against Bruce. A great battle was fought, and Bruce was beaten.

But the English could not drive him away from his country. He raised another army. Another battle was fought, and he was beaten again. But still he did not lose heart. Six times did he lead his brave men against the English, and six times did the battle go against him.

At last he had to hide himself in the woods and among the mountains. Some of his men were in one place, some in another. Many of his best friends had lost their lives. He was almost ready to give up in despair. One day he was hiding in a little hut on the side of a mountain. He lay on the floor of the hut, and thought of the sad things that had happened to his country and to himself.

“It is of no use to try any longer,” he said to himself.

Just then he saw a spider on one of the beams above him. It was making its web, and Bruce, having nothing else to do, lay still and watched it. The spider was trying hard to fasten one of its threads to another beam a little lower down. It would have to do this before it could make a web that would be of use.

It swung itself down and tried to catch hold of the beam, but the wind carried it past, and it fell to the ground. Then there was no other way but to climb up again to the higher beam and try the same thing another time. Bruce lay upon the floor of the hut, and watched it try again and again. Six times it swung itself down and failed to reach the lower beam. Six times it climbed with great labor to the upper beam and made ready to try again.

“And I have failed six times, too,” said Bruce.

But the seventh time the spider carried the thread straight down to the lower beam, fastened it there, and then it was easy enough to make the rest of the web.

“I will try the seventh time!,” said Bruce.

He jumped to his feet. He went out of the hut and called his men together. He told them of his plans, and all were glad to make one more trial to set their country free. A few days after that another battle was fought, and this time the English were beaten. It was not long until Bruce had driven them out of the land, and was the true king of Scotland again.

“It was the spider that did it,” he said.

“If it had not been for the spider, I should not have tried the seventh time.”
McGuffey New Fourth Eclectic Reader: Extract From “The Sermon on the Mount”

1. Bless’ed; v. happy
2. In-her’it; v. to come into possession of.
4. Re-vile’; v. to speak against without cause
5. De-spite’ful-ly; adv. Maliciously
6. Pub-li-can; n.-a collector of taxes (These, among Jews, were very bad men.)

Extract From The Sermon on the Mount

Remark—The words Lord and God are seldom pronounced with that full and solemn sound that is proper. Lud and Laward and Gud and Gawd, are too frequently used instead of the proper sounds. If the pupil can learn to speak the three words, O—Lord—God, in a clear, full, and solemn tone, it will be worth no little attention.

Articulate the r in the following words, poor, their, hunger, are, pure, members, forswear, perform, earth, neither, heard, more, therefore, perfect. See Ex. V, page 27.

1. BLESSED are the poor in spirit; for theirs is the kingdom of heaven. Blessed are they that mourn; for they shall be comforted. Blessed are meek; for they shall inherit the earth.
2. Blessed are they which do hunger and thirst after righteousness; for they shall be filled. Blessed are the merciful; for they shall be filled. Blessed are the merciful; for they shall obtain mercy. Blessed are the pure in heart; for they shall see God.
3. Blessed are the peace-makers; for they shall be called the children of God. Blessed are they which are persecuted for righteousness sake; for theirs is the kingdom of heaven.
4. Blessed are ye when men shall revile you, and persecute you, and shall say all manner of evil against you falsely, for my sake. Rejoice and be exceeding glad; for great is your reward in heaven.
5. You have heard that it hath been said, Thou shalt have they neighbor and hate thine enemy: but I say into you, Love your enemies, bless them that curse you, do good to them that hate you, and pray for them which despitefully use you and persecute you; that we may be the children of your Father which is in heaven: for He maketh His sun to rise on the evil and on the good, and sendeth rain on the just and on the unjust.
6. For if you love them which love you, what reward have ye? do not even the publicans the same? And if ye salute your brethren only, what do ye more than others? do not even the publicans so? Be ye, therefore, perfect, even as your Father which is in heaven is perfect.

Exercises—Who delivered this sermon? Why are the poor in spirit blessed or happy? Why, they that mourn? What kind of mourners are intended? Why are the meek happy? Why, they who hunger and thirst after righteousness? Why, the merciful? Why, the pure in heart? Why, peace-makers? Why, the persecuted for righteousness’ sake? What should we do to our enemies? What does God do to the evil and the good?

In the first sentence, for what does the pronoun theirs stand? Which are the nouns in the sentence? Which are the verbs? Which is the conjunction?

Which words are in the objective case? Which in the nominative? What does the word nominative mean? See Pinneo’s Primary Grammar, Art. 94, page 51.
1. In’do-lent; adj. lazy; idle
8. Com-mer’cial; adj. trading.
8. Com’ic-al; adj. amusing.
3. Drone; n. an idler.
4. Nav’i-ga-ble; adj. in which boats can sail.

The Idle School-Boy

Pronounce correctly. Do not say indorlunt for in-do-lent; Creepin for creep-ing; sylubble for syl-la-ble; colud for col-o-red; scarlit for scar-let ignerunt for ig-no-rant.

1. I WILL tell you about the laziest boy you ever heard of. He was indolent about every thing. When he played, the boys said he played as if the teacher told him to. When he went to school, he went creeping along like a snail. The boy had sense enough; but he was too lazy to learn any thing.
2. When he spelled a word, he drawled out one syllable after another, as if he were afraid the syllables would quarrel, if he did not keep them a great way apart.
3. Once when he was reciting, the teacher asked him “What is said of Hartford?” He answered, “Hartford is a flourishing comical town.” He meant that it was a “flourishing commercial town;” but he was such a drone, that he never knew what he was about.
4. When asked how far the River Kennebee was navigable, he said, “it was navigable for boots as far as Waterville.” The boys all laughed, and the teacher could not help laughing, too. The idle boy colored like scarlet.
5. “I say it is so in my book,” said he. When one of the boys showed him the book, and pointed to the place where it was said, that the Kennebee was navigable for boots as far as Waterville, he stood with his hands in his pockets, and his mouth open, as he could not understand what they were all laughing at.
6. Another day, when the boys were reciting a lesson in defining, he made a mistake worse than all the rest. The word A-CEPH’A-LOUS was printed with syllables divided as you see. The meaning given of the word was, “without a head.”
7. The idle boy had often been laughed at for being so slow in saying his lessons. This time, he thought he would be very quick and smart. So he spelled the word before the teacher had a chance to put it out. And how do you think he spelled it?
8. “A-C-E-P-H, ACEPH,” said he, “a louse without a head.” The boys laughed at him so much about this that he was obliged to leave school. The teacher said, “he was a drone, and the working bees stung him out of the hive.”
9. You can easily guess what luck this idle boy had. With all his father’s care to have him learn, he would be a dunce; not because he was a fool, but because he was too lazy to give his thoughts to anything.
10. He had some fortune left him. But he was too lazy to take care of it, and now he goes about the streets, begging his bread. He often wishes that he had been more attentive to his books, when young. But he can not live over again the time he has spent so badly, and he must be a poor ignorant fellow for the rest of his life.

Exercises—What is this lesson about? How did the idle boy play? What did he say about Hartford? What did he say about the Kennebec River? How did he spell and define acephalous? Can you define it? What became of the lazy boy?
Module: American Citizenship Then, Now, and the Future? (class two)

Give the short quiz "U.S. Citizenship: Historical Documents" and briefly provide students with correct answers (estimated time, ten to fifteen minutes)

Rest of page intentionally left blank
Module 1 Short Quiz: U.S. Citizenship: Historical Documents

Directions: this is an open quiz, which means you may use your notes from last class along with your homework for today.

1. What is a citizen?
   a. A person who legally belongs to a nation.
   b. A person who enters and remains in a nation for at least five years.
   c. A person who votes, serves on a jury, and is eligible for a military draft.
   d. A person who possesses all the privileges and responsibilities granted by the law of a nation to its members.
   e. All of the above
   f. Both A and D
   g. Both B and C
   h. A, B, and C

2. Who was the author of The New England Primer?
   a. Noah Webster
   b. William McGuffey
   c. Horace Mann
   d. Benjamin Harris

3. The following was the earliest text to receive almost universal usage in America:
   a. The New England Primer
   b. The Farmer’s Almanac
   c. McGuffey’s Readers
   d. Webster’s Blue-Back Spellers

4. Which of the following remained highly prominent among American schoolchildren until WWII?
   a. The New England Primer
   b. The Farmer’s Almanac
   c. McGuffey’s Readers
   d. Webster’s Blue-Back Spellers

5. After closely reading each of these, it becomes clear that in the early Republic, American citizens were profoundly shaped by which of the following (circle all that apply)?
   a. Roman Catholicism
   b. Protestant Christianity
   c. A “rugged individual” ethic which placed emphasis on hard work and obedience
   d. A clear emphasis on religious pluralism and moral tolerance
Review Augustine’s metric with the class and then ask the following question:

As you completed your primary source-based homework, did you find similarities or differences in what early Americans were taught to love (what educators expected would bind them together)?

Use student answers from the "Formation of Citizens” worksheet to create a list on the whiteboard of common expectations of knowledge, skills, and values for early citizens.

In the discussion, help students understand the following key points:

Since most American children for hundreds of years learned by using these books, we can deduce from them many common values educators and political leaders historically thought appropriate to teach the nation’s children.

Reframe what follows into a question (what other book or books do you think Americans in past times commonly read?) designed to assist students to think about how changing American cultural values affect contemporary and future beliefs about citizenship, or share the following observation with students:

In early American instruction, the King James Bible was the most widely used book in schools for literacy instruction.

Make students aware that increasing cultural pluralism, particularly shortly before and after the Civil War, meant that by the middle of the nineteenth century, controversies were already beginning to occur in newly emerging public schools about the Protestant Bible's use—particularly if Catholics and Jews attended specific public schools. The controversies about religion in the public schools continually expanded in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, for various reasons (incorporation of the theory of evolution in science courses, immigration of peoples from other areas than western and northern Europe) and resulted in the controversial Supreme Court prayer decisions (Murray v. Curlett 1963 was the most famous) where the nation’s highest court interpreted the religion Establishment Clause of the First Amendment to the U.S. Constitution as banning government at any level, including public (local government) schools from endorsing any specific religion or making religious instruction part of the formal curriculum. (Students should understand that Supreme Court bans on government schools teaching religion do not extend to public schools teaching about religion and do not prevent private schools from teaching religion.) In the 1990 Board of Education v. Mergens case, the Supreme Court also affirmed the right of public school students to exercise their First Amendment right to freedom of religion at school through forming extracurricular religious clubs (estimated time, seven to ten minutes).

Use student responses to begin to create a column on the whiteboard titled "What Knowledge, Skills, and Values Contemporary Citizens Should Hold in Common."

The objective of the final discussion for class two is not for students to reach consensus but for serious reflection about what contemporary beliefs and developments constitute American citizenship and what might be done to strengthen civic education. Begin discussion with the following discussion statement:
In the contemporary U.S., list examples of common knowledge, values, and skills that most Americans agree are critical for good citizenship.

The ensuing discussion is intended to be open-ended to a certain extent, but teachers might wish to pose some of the following questions or utilize additional follow-up activities that are juxtaposed by select questions.

What common content about American history and government is most important for American citizens to know, in your opinion?

Teaching toleration of different beliefs has been particularly emphasized in most of the nation’s schools the past fifty to sixty years. What are possible positive and negative effects on citizenship because of the strong emphasis on teaching tolerance?

How can schools teach children to both care about their nation, state, and community, and strive for personal achievement? Is teaching the latter value even important for good citizenship; why or why not?

Is the cultivation of good character essential for good citizenship? Most (almost 90 percent) of American students attend public schools, where explicit religious instruction is illegal. Can good character be taught without explicit religious instruction either in schools or the home? Why or why not? Is it possible to teach about religion in public schools without teaching religion? (see three extension activities)*

Numerous media interviews with random people indicate that many citizens don’t have basic knowledge of how our government works; perhaps the most famous of many surveys a few years ago indicated that the sample of respondents knew more about the TV show *The Simpsons* than the Bill of Rights:

http://tinyurl.com/y8jne672

The framers of our Constitution believed that representative government where ordinary citizens were given the right to vote was impossible without a critical mass of educated citizens. How might civic education be improved, in your opinion? (estimated time, ten to fifteen minutes)

In preparation for class three, distribute or provide the link of "*The Man Without a Country*" by Edward Everett Hale and assign it to students to read for homework. Explain to students that often works of fiction can impart values or messages to readers that are important insights on many aspects of human life, including politics and citizenship. Just because a story is fiction doesn’t mean it is not “true.” Share the brief synopsis of the story with students (estimated time, five minutes).

This short story by American author Edward Everett Hale, first published in 1863, tells the story of an American Army lieutenant, Philip Nolan. The story begins with Mr. Nolan on trial for treason. In the midst of the trial, Mr. Nolan renounces his country. The judge determines that the appropriate punishment would be to ban him from the United States indefinitely. More than that, however, Mr. Nolan is confined to an American warship and is not allowed to ever read or hear a word about his abandoned country. As the story unfolds, we watch how being without a country affects Mr. Nolan.
Instructors might also want to ask that students watch a conversation with Professor Wilfred McClay on "The Man Without a Country." The conversation with McClay is available at What So Proudly We Hail.

Module: Reflections on Citizenship through Literature (class three)

First, without discussing important themes in the story, make sure that students comprehended the plot through asking questions like what happened to Nolan and why? What was his sentence? What were the major events in the story after Nolan began to serve his sentence? How does the story end?

Then, move to more reflective questions:

What appealed to you about the story? Why?

What did you not like about the story? Why?

Do you think few, some, or many Americans your age generally would or would not like this story? Why?

Was Nolan’s punishment appropriate? Do you think a similar punishment should be used today for a citizen convicted of treason?

What do you think of Hale’s description of a man no longer attached to a country? Do you find it appealing or convincing? Why or why not? (estimated time, fifty minutes)

Assessment

Students will be assessed on the knowledge and/or skills gained from the module in three ways:

"U.S. Citizenship: Historical Documents" short quiz at the beginning of the second class. The quiz is designed to reflect the student’s engagement in the homework assignment.

Active participation, largely based on the extent and quality of the student’s verbal interaction with his or her peers and the instructor during classes.

The homework assignment “The Formation of Citizens.” This assessment will enable the instructor to detect the student's comprehension level with regard to the primary source documents.

Enrichment/alternative activities*

The topic of citizenship is so complex that interested instructors might wish to enrich understanding through using the following three activities.
The Puritan Values Exercise

Without using the term “Puritan,” have students complete a short “values survey” (https://www.utc.edu/center-reflective-citizenship/pdfs/crcpuritanvalues.pdf) where they agree, disagree, or check undecided regarding whether teachers should promote twelve values.
## Values Survey

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teachers should promote:</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Undecided</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Respect for authority</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Postponing immediate gratification</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neatness</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Punctuality</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responsibility for one's own work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honesty</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patriotism and loyalty</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Striving for personal achievement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repression of aggression and overt sexual expression</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respect for the rights and property of others</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obeying rules and regulations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Once the class completes the surveys, indicate that the authors of a highly popular college-level American educational history text trace all the values in the survey back to our Puritan heritage. Then, share this following quotation from the text with students:

"Without making a judgment about these values, it may be pointed out that teaching them creates certain problems. Ours is a multicultural society in which minority and ethnic groups differ in the emphasis they place on traditional values of the majority culture." Pulliam and Van Patten

Conclude this activity through asking the following questions:

When you took the values survey, did you think at all about the Puritans?

Did you associate the values in the survey with Christianity?

Do only Caucasian Americans who are Christians believe these values?

(If students don’t make this point, instructors are encouraged to indicate that Japanese, Taiwanese, and many Chinese are not Christian but make these values part of their daily lives. The same is also true of many Americans who are not Caucasian.)

Instructors might ask students whether these values are Puritan values or middle-class values.

**Citizenship and Morality: Illustrations of the Tao Exercise**

Many educators are familiar with C. S. Lewis from his children’s books and popular books on Christianity. However, in 1943, Lewis wrote one book on education titled *The Abolition of Man*. Lewis’s central assertion in the book is that because of natural law, there are objective moral values shared by many cultures that in the twentieth century were continually attacked by moral relativists. In the appendix of Lewis’s short book, he listed moral rules of behavior that were historically shared by many religions and belief systems.

Examples include prohibitions against murder, hatred, and doing to others what you would not like them to do to you. Share excerpts from the appendix of *The Abolition of Man* (available at [http://tinyurl.com/l3s2r5g](http://tinyurl.com/l3s2r5g)).

Ask students to discuss whether it is possible to teach and model these values in schools without religious instruction.

**Humility and American Citizenship**

In 2013, Dr. David Bobb, president of The Bill of Rights Institute, published the book *Humility: An Unlikely Biography of America’s Greatest Virtue*. His work is an historically based argument for the role of the virtue of humility in contributing to the profound success of the United States as a nation.

Have students watch Bobb’s fifty-one-minute lecture ([http://youtu.be/3P4rXGf5DO8](http://youtu.be/3P4rXGf5DO8)) based on his book and react to what they learn about the virtues of humility, leadership, and citizenship.
References and Resources

http://tinyurl.com/y7u4rh4m and http://tinyurl.com/yahk3fvf are full-text of volumes 1 and 2 of The City of God by St. Augustine.


http://tinyurl.com/y7e7kmjm: This is a link to The New England Primer by Benjamin Harris that was reprinted in 1899 by The University Press (edited by Paul Leicester Ford).

https://www.loc.gov/item/11012477/: This is a link to Noah Webster’s Blue-Back Speller, printed in Boston by Isaiah Thomas and Ebenezer T. Andrews, 1970.


http://tinyurl.com/y8jne672 This is a link to an NBC News story on how many Americans know more about The Simpsons than they do about the Bill of Rights.

https://www.whatsoproudlywehail.org/?p=1151: From the American literature website What So Proudly We Hail, the “National Identity and Why It Matters” curriculum unit includes the text of “The Man Without a Country” by Edward Everett Hale and a video lecture on the story by Wilfred McClay.

John D. Pulliam and James J. Van Patten, History of Education in America, 7th edition: Source for the content of the values survey and the quotation that precedes questions to students.

http://tinyurl.com/l3s2r5g: This link includes the full text of C.S. Lewis’s The Abolition of Man, including “The Law of General Beneficence” and ”The Law of Mercy” excerpts from the book’s appendix.

http://youtu.be/3F4rXGf5DO8: This is a lecture by David Bobb, president of the Bill of Rights Institute, on his book Humility: An Unlikely Biography of America's Greatest Virtue.

Lawrence A. Cremin, American Education: The National Experience 1783-1876: This book, published in 1980, won a Pulitzer Prize in 1981 and is considered the definitive source on educational history of this period.